

ARGUMENTATION & ADVOCACY

VOLUME 41, NUMBER 3/WINTER 2005

FEATURED ARTICLES

When Times Collide: Ward Churchill's Use of an Epideictic Moment to Ground Forensic Argument

Catherine Helen Palczewski 123

During Denver's 1991 Columbus Day parade, fifty Native Americans briefly blocked the parade. As part of the trial of four protesters, Ward Churchill authored a legal brief that contributed to their acquittal. This essay advances two intertwined arguments as to why Churchill's brief was effective. First, Churchill skillfully adapted to the forensic form through his choice of expert persona, objective tone, Euramerican evidence and deductive structure, effectively shifting attention from the guilt of the protesters to the blameworthy genocidal actions of Euramericans. Second, because the trial concerned actions that occurred at the epideictic moment created by the Columbus Day parade, a rupture of time in the forensic setting occurred whereby Native American re-presentations of past atrocities became relevant to the case at hand.

Key words: Ward Churchill, Columbus Day, Native American rhetoric, collective memory, epideictic, forensic

Norms of Presentational Force

Beth Innocenti Manolescu 139

Can style or presentational devices reasonably compel us to believe, agree, act? I submit that they can, and that the normative pragmatic project explains how. After describing a normative pragmatic approach to presentational force, I analyze and evaluate presentational force in Susan B. Anthony's "Is it a Crime for a U. S. Citizen to Vote?" as it apparently proceeds from logic, emotion, and style. I conclude with reflections on the compatibility of the normative pragmatic approach with the recently-developed pragma-dialectical treatment of presentational devices.

Key words: force, normative pragmatics, style, strategic maneuvering, Susan B. Anthony

The Role of Public Opinion in Policy Argument: An Examination of Public Opinion Rhetoric in the Federal Budget Process

David G. Levasseur 152


Public opinion plays a vital role in a democracy. Scholars have yet to explore how public opinion is constructed in policy argument in many significant policy areas. Through an examination of budget rhetoric over a three-year period, this study uncovers several argument patterns that incorporate public opinion. These patterns, in their totality, yield two major conclusions. First, public opinion arguments rarely surface in budget rhetoric. Second, in budget debates politicians construct a discursive conception of public opinion. The revealed relationship between public opinion and public argument has both helpful and harmful implications for the public sphere and democratic governance.

Key words: policy argument, federal budget, public opinion, democracy

Deductivism as an Interpretive Strategy: A Reply to Groarke's Recent Defense of Reconstructive Deductivism *David M. Godden* 168

Deductivism has been presented variously as an evaluative thesis and as an interpretive one. I argue that deductivism fails as a universal evaluative thesis, and that its value as an interpretive thesis must be supported on other grounds. As a reconstructive strategy, deductivism is justified only on the grounds that an arguer is, or ought to be, aiming at the deductive standard of evidence. As such, the reconstruction of an argument as deductive must be supported by contextual and situational factors including facts about the arguer. Further, the plausibility of deductivism as a normative thesis is not tied to its plausibility as a descriptive or interpretive thesis.

Key words: deductivism, argument reconstruction, argument evaluation, standards of evidence, commitment

 BOOK REVIEWS

Review of Michael Rabinder James, *Deliberative Democracy and the Plural Polity* *Vanessa B. Beasley* 184

Review of Anna Gavanas, *Fatherhood Politics in the United States: Masculinity, Sexuality, Race, and Marriage* *Jeffrey W. Jarman* 185

Review of Tal Golan, *Laws of Men and Laws of Nature: The History of Scientific Expert Testimony in England and America* *Christopher Salinas* 188