

ARGUMENTATION & ADVOCACY

VOLUME 41, NUMBER 2/FALL 2004

41 SPECIAL ISSUE ON NONGRECO-ROMAN ARGUMENTATION

Challenging Greco-Roman Argumentation Trajectories: Argument Norms and Cultural Traditions *Steven C. Combs, Guest Editor* 55

The Useless-/Usefulness of Argumentation: The Dao of Disputation *Steven C. Combs* 58

This essay answers the call for comparative studies of argumentation by examining Daoist (Taoist) approaches to argumentation. Through analysis of the works of Laozi (Lao Tzu) and Zhuangzi (Chuang Tzu), this essay moves beyond the admonitions against argument found in previous research, and articulates principles of argumentation that stem from the Daoist world-view. It will be shown that Daoism, while differing in many key assumptions about the role and methods of argumentation, is a useful addition to western theorizing about argumentation, enhancing our understanding of human discursive practices. Daoist argumentation focuses on knowledge rather than truth, processes rather than products, and comprehensive interdependence rather than distinction and categorization. Daoist argument does not seek a reduction in uncertainty, such as a conclusion or decision, but rather welcomes ambiguity and opens up possibilities by questioning dubious claims and overgeneralizations.

Key words: Daoism, Laozi, Zhuangzi, Chinese rhetoric, argumentation

Arguing with God, Talmudic Discourse, and the Jewish Countermodel: Implications for the Study of Argumentation *David A. Frank* 71

Hebraic and Greco-Roman traditions of argument and argumentation both diverge and converge on key notions. In this paper, I explore these differences and commonalities by considering the Jewish tradition of arguing with God and in community. I examine three instances in the Jewish Bible of human argument with God, highlight key principles of argument in the Talmud, and reflect on the contributions made to an understanding of a Jewish- inflected argument in the twentieth century by Emmanuel Levinas and Chaim Perelman. In the conclusion I juxtapose the Jewish and Greco-Roman traditions of argument and suggest that the former favors ethics over ontology, the vita activa over the vita contemplativa, rhetoric over philosophy, and argumentative reasoning over apodictic logic, thereby reversing the terms of classical thought.

Key words: argument, God, Talmud, Jewish, Greco-Roman

Factionalism as Argumentation: A Case Study of the Indigenous Communication Practices of Jemez Pueblo *Robert S. Littlefield and Jane A. Ball* 87

This study identifies seven characteristics of argumentation and demonstrates how the factionalism of Jemez Pueblo in New Mexico serves as an indigenous form of argumentation for that society. We analyze two examples of factionalism: the case of the governor's authority and the case for religious freedom. In both, six phases of factionalism are identified and found to illustrate how this form of argumentation provides a useful method of decision-making for the Jemez.

Key words: factionalism, Jemez Pueblo, Greco-Roman, argumentation, mediation

“This Painful Chapter”: An Analysis of Emperor Akihito’s Apologia in the Context of Dutch Old Sores Takeshi Suzuki and Frans H. van Eemeren 102

This essay analyzes two speeches presented on the occasion of the Japanese Imperial Couple’s visit to the Netherlands in 2000, which played an important role in restoring the good relationship between the two countries. Starting from a general theoretical perspective on apologetic discourse we explain how argumentative apologetic discourse can be analyzed as strategic maneuvering. This theoretical background is applied to clarify the strategic maneuvering in the speeches of the Dutch Queen Beatrix and the Japanese Emperor Akihito at a State Banquet in Dam Palace on May 23, 2000. The Dutch people’s reaction to the Emperor’s apologia is examined, paying special attention to the role of ethos. Our conclusions discuss the difference between the Occidental form of communicative action known as apologia and apologetic discourse as it is accepted in Japanese culture. A clever coordination is observed between the strategic efforts of the Dutch and the Japanese fully to restore their friendly ties. A crucial element consists in exploiting the ethos derived from the Emperor’s special status in Japanese society.

Key words: argumentation, apologia, Japanese Emperor, genre, pragma-dialectics

 BOOK REVIEWS

Review of Michael Mello, **Legalizing Gay Marriage** Isaac West 112

Review of David Couzens Hoy, **Critical Resistance** Kevin Kuswa 114

Review of Xing Lu, **Rhetoric of the Chinese Cultural Revolution: The Impact on Chinese Thought, Culture, and Communication** Ben Krueger 116

Review of John Howe, **Language and Political Meaning in Revolutionary America** Jeff D. Bass 117

Review of Melissa Checker and Maggie Fishman, **Local Actions: Cultural Activism, Power, and Public Life in America** Elisia L. Cohen 120